

LAMALERA BALI MEETING REPORT

(MEETING MINUTES)

Name	Saraswati-Photovoices
Date of meeting	11-12 March 2008
Meeting venue	Inna Natour Sindhu Beach Hotel – Sanur Bali
Purpose of meeting	Photovoices Lamalera – Information Sharing Meeting
Other joining/Meeting member	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ann McBride Norton (Photovoices Director) 2. Heidi Arbuckle (Ford Foundation) 3. Ujjwal Pradhan (ford Foundation) 4. Elshinta Marsdhen (Communication Senior Manager WWF Indonesia) 5. Lida Pet Soede (Coral triangle Leader-WWF Indonesia-Marine Expert) 6. Tri Agung (Deputy Director Marine Program WWF Indonesia) 7. Ardi Sastra Hidayat (Sie manager Solor Alor marine Program) 8. Maria Lakaseru (Communication Outreach Officer Solor Alor WWF Indonesia) 9. Yanti Purnomo (Community Development Officer Solor Alor WWF Indonesia) 10. Lene Topp (WWF-Denmark DANIDA Project) 11. Benjamin Khan (Director APEX Environmental Asia pacific Oceanic program-Whale sperm expert) 12. Leonard Nahak (Sosilogist-Head of Kupang Musium) 13. John Claussen (CCIF Director) 14. Tri Sukirman (Communication Manager TNC) 15. Gede Warmadewa (Coral Triangle-TNC) 16. Eri Endrawan Biro KLH ,Departments of Forestry Affairs 17. Dorotheus Blajan Tapoona (Photovoices Photographer Villager Lamalera B) 18. Hendrikus Kia Kerat (Photovoices- Head of Village Lamalera A) 19. Katharina Nudek (Photovoices Photographer Villager Lamalera A) 20. Nadus Batafor (Photovoices Photographer-Villager lamalera B)

	<p>21. Peter Bataona (Sosiologist/Antropologist-Lamalera)</p> <p>22. Fransiskus Use Bataona (Photovoices – Head of Village Lamalera B)</p> <p>23. Yanto Lelaona (Photovoices-Villager Lamalera A)</p> <p>24. Albertus Magnus (Photovoices field assistant)</p> <p>25. Valentinus Solo (Head of SMPK APPIS Lamalera)</p> <p>26. Made Netra (Interpreter - Udayana University)</p> <p>27. Tanyo Bangun (Chef Editor National Geographic Indonesia)</p> <p>28. Saraswati (Photovoices Program Coordinator)</p> <p>29. Karidewi (Assistant - Coral Triangle WWF Indonesia)</p> <p>30. Umi Kesumawati (Committee)</p> <p>31. Scholastica (Photovoices Internship -Tranlater)</p> <p>32. Rudi tan (Committee)</p> <p>33. Tommy Zhult (PV-Communication specialist counsultant)</p>
PROCESS/AGENDA	<p>The meeting agenda:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Opening 2. Presentation about the social, cultural, and religious life of the Lamalera people—including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lamalera whaling traditions • Current social and cultural life • Identification of modernization impacts. • The relationship between tribal tradition and religious life in Lamalera • The future hopes of the Lamalera people, including the socio-cultural life of the village 3. Presentation about whaling activities <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • History of whaling activities in the village • The relationship between tradition and whaling • Changes in whaling practices due to modernization (such as using outboard motors to power the whaling boats instead of using the traditional sails or paddles) • The hopes of Lamalera people that their whaling traditions,

	<p>culture and local wisdom will survive into the future and that their way of life will continue through conservation of the marine environment.</p> <p>4. Presentation about the social and economic life of the Lamalera people</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A description of the natural resources and economic potential of the Lamalera people. • Identification of strengths, weaknesses, challenges and constraints faced by the Lamalera people in their daily lives. • The concern of the Lamalera people for their economic futures because of potentially dwindling natural resources (whales, fish, etc). • Possible solutions to the economic and development problems faced by the Lamalera people. <p>5. Presentation about the Photovoices Lamalera School Club Program for local children at the SMPK Middle School:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An overview of the Photovoices School Club Program. • The success of the School Club in helping to raise test scores among the student participants. • An overview of the Photovoices School Club program at the school. <p>6. Closing Remarks</p> <p><u>Note:</u></p> <p>The meeting was led by the Lamalera village representatives and the photos taken by the villagers during the Photovoices project were used to illustrate each of the above themes and concerns to all the attendees. In addition to the photographs, the Lamalera village representatives also brought a traditional tempuling (whaling harpoon—nearly ten feet long), samples of their handwoven ikat sarongs, traditional weaving tools, teeth from sperm whales, and even included a miniature paledang (whaling boat). In addition, a narrated slide show of pictures from the</p>
--	--

	<p>Photovoices project was presented.</p>
THE MEETING	<p>Day 1: March 11th, 2008, <u>(Moderator : lida Pet Soede)</u></p> <p>1. Opening</p> <p>Photovoices Director-Ann McBride welcomed all the attendees and gave an overview of the Photovoices Lamalera project. She also thanked the Lamalera people for having made this program successful by sharing the strengths, problems, worries, and hopes that they have for the future of their community with everyone involved. It was emphasized that the meeting belonged to the people of Lamalera who best know their local environment and the problems they face in the future. During the two day meeting, the Lamalera representatives shared knowledge about their social, cultural and economic life. As a result, all of the meeting participants learned much about Lamalera from the local people themselves. Following the presentations led by the representatives from Lamalera, there was a discussion amongst the Lamalera villagers and the panel of experts gathered at the meeting. This dialogue was a very useful exchange ideas and as a result, the discussion helped to spread knowledge about Lamalera among the group and will hopefully lead to potential solutions to the problems facing the community in the future.</p> <p>WWF Deputy Marine Director Tri Agung described the relationship of the WWF's conservation program in Solor Alor (Lamalera) and the Photovoices project. The partnership is an important part of the WWF Solor Alor Marine program of the Ecosystem Based Management in the Sawu Sea, which is an important migratory route for marine mammals, sea turtles and other pelagic species such as tuna fish. In an effort to achieve the goals of the program, a multi-party group of stakeholders</p>

	<p>represents the conservation and community development program on Lembata island. As a result, all the stakeholders involved are discussing the criteria for conservation planning and the condition of the natural resources in the area. Community participation projects such as Photovoices have proven to be a very useful tool to help other conservation organizations and decision makers understand the life, culture and natural resources in the region, as well as communicating the feelings of local people about their culture and natural environment.</p> <p>Before the presentation, Pak Chales remarked that the community representatives attending the Bali Meeting were there on behalf of the Lamalera people. The Lamalera representatives consisted of five village figures and two village leaders. Before coming to Bali, the Lamalera representatives held a meeting in the village to hear the concerns of the community. In addition, they had a discussion about the materials to be presented at the meeting and also asked for advice from the local adat leader about the information that they would present in Bali.</p> <p>1. Social, cultural and religious life of Lamalera people was presented by Nadus Bathafor.</p> <p>The social and cultural life of Lamalera was described in detail, beginning with the history and roles of the original tribes settling in Lamalera as well as animistic and religious ritual traditions.</p> <p>Three principles most important to the Lamalera people are: their tribe, their clan house, and the paledang (whaling boats). Over the course of more than 600 years, the Lamalera people have followed strong traditions and are very proud of the way of life they have made, which has maintained a harmonious relationship within the community. They believe that any unsolved problems on the land directly affect the results on the sea (such as whaling).</p>
--	---

	<p>At the close of the Photovoices project in Lamalera, the people were able to identify some changes in social and cultural life of the village due to modernization. However, the people believe that most of these changes have affected only external aspects of their culture—the traditional philosophy at the core remains largely unchanged to this day.</p> <p>Examples of traditional practices that have changed:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The marriage tradition: In the past, a dowry should be ivory from an elephant, but because it is now hard to find an ivory, people use money today. However, the term they use for the dowry in the local language is still “ivory” and not money. In this way, the meaning and philosophy behind this marriage tradition has not changed. 2. Ritual adat Tobe nama pate: this is a communal discussion where women used to be excluded. People now think that it is actually important to involve the women, so they would like to talk again about it. 3. The Lamalera people have many strengths; one of them is the role of each tribe in the community. For example, the Olaona tribe has a power to make the waves small and the Atagora tribe can call the whirlingwind. Lamalera has 12 tribes that have different skills, however the people have said that these powers are decreasing as the modernization changes daily life in the village. 4. The sarong for belis (dowry) is still made of original threads, but the sarong given to a woman who will be married is made of ikat threads. 5. During the 2007 Lefa season ritual, the people forgot to include fish bones (they used only whale bones instead). As a result, they took 44 whales (the greatest number in the history of the village), but the fish catch was very small.
--	--

	<p>In general, it is not easy for an outsider to influence the Lamalera people. Today however, the village elders are very concerned that the youngest generations will forget their culture as they go to school—which is outside of Lamalera. As the result, many of them do not feel interested in learning about their culture any more.</p> <p>The Lamalera people are devout Catholics. However, they still maintain their ancestral values by practicing their ancient animistic rituals. The church has never imposed any restrictions on these rituals and as a result, both traditions and religion can co-exist harmoniously.</p> <p>One important result of the Photovoices Project in Lamalera is that the important rituals have been documented, preserving the rituals, hopes and beliefs of the Lamalera community for future generations. The project will also enable the youngest generation to learn more about the traditional culture and rituals practiced by their ancestors. Even today, the youth have become more involved in the traditions and rituals of Lamalera.</p> <p>2. "Achievement in whaling" was presented by Doretheus Blajan Tapaona</p> <p>"Many people call us as whale hunter. It is actually not true because what we are doing is not hunting, but catching the whales that come to the Lamalera sea territory. We do not hunt the whales in the neighboring territories as what is done by Japan. Lamalera people use the whale meat for their food or they do traditional barter with corns and other products from the mountain and the neighboring village. In 1410, the ancestor of Lamalera who came from Luwuk already had whaling skill."</p> <p>According to Lamalera people, the whales are an embodiment of their ancestors that provide them food to eat. Therefore, they call the whale</p>
--	---

	<p>'ama' /bapa/ibu which means both father and mother. As a sign of respect to their ancestors, if the whalers find a manta and whale at the same time, they will pursue the manta instead of the whale.</p> <p>The basic practices of whaling such as the tobu nama fate and ei gerek ceremonies have changed little over the years, but the tools that they use have changed from time to time. For example, the tempuling (harpoon) used to be made of wood, but is made of iron today. In the past, the leo (rope to attach the harpoon) was made of woven tree bark fibers, but today it is woven from cotton thread. Another significant change is the occasional use of a motorboat during the whaling season.</p> <p>Another practice that has held strong throughout the years is the ritual blessing of the leo (rope to attach the harpoon) at the beginning of lefa (whaling) season. In recent years, in an attempt to show tourists some examples of the Lamalera cultural rituals, the people have placed the leo rope under the shady tree (which is called 'neme') so it is easier to see. In the past the leo ceremony was held in the clan house while the people prayed.</p> <p>At present, the younger generation prefers to use the motorboat rather than using the paddle as they have in the past. The village elders are concerned that this aspect of the traditional whaling culture will be lost. It has been observed that when the whalers use the motorboat, they rarely sing their traditional whaling songs as they have for generations before. The traditional whaling songs were sung as a sign of thanks to the ancestors of Lamalera for providing the whale for their food. An important result of the Photovoices project was an increased awareness of what has been forgotten today they have begun to document the songs for future generations.</p> <p>A long time ago, the barter market was intended only to fulfill people's</p>
--	---

	<p>basic need (food). Today, with the increased need to pay for things such as housing, school, wedding ceremonies, and healthcare, some of the villagers sell their whale meat, which can bring a high price at the market because it is very valuable.</p> <p>The Lamalera people depend on the whaling to maintain their livelihoods, and do not want to lose the culture of whaling that is so important to their community. If there are any changes to the regulations governing the number of whales that the Lamalera community is allowed to catch, it is their strong belief that an alternative livelihood will need to be developed for them to make their livings.</p> <p>The Sawu sea is also rich with marine resources such as tuna, cakalan, and flying fish but a lack of training in fishing methodologies has prevented the Lamalera people from being able to use these resources for their livelihood more effectively. The community has realized that whaling activities are very risky, and many whalers have died over the years in pursuit of the whales. However, a deep respect of their ancestors and whaling traditions has convinced them to maintain their strong culture of whaling.</p> <p>Day 2, on March 2008</p> <p><u>Moderator: Lida Pet Soede</u></p> <p>Theme</p> <p>1: Social Economic life of Lamalera people presented by Yanto Lelaona, the representative of the young people from Lamalera.</p> <p>Hendrikus Keraf (the village leader) provided an overview of the demographics of Lamalera village:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There are 474 families - 42 people serve as civil employees - 100 people are farmers
--	---

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 332 people are full-time fisherman - There are 20 whaling boats, but 17 are actively used. - There are 22 Johnson outboard boats. - There are 52 small boats. <p>The coastline surrounding Lamalera is rocky, so it is hard for the people to farm for their livelihoods and as a result they depend on the sea. The Sawu sea is rich in the marine life that the people rely on for their daily meals. Apart from the whale, Sawu sea has an abundance of small fish species as well as cakalalang and tuna. In regards to the socioeconomic life of Lamalera, men and women have different roles in the community, which are basically divided into two: those on land and at sea.</p> <p>The roles of men are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Fishing: At times when no whales are seen passing by the village, the men will fish in the sea by using a fishing rod and “bubu”. - They typically have a low rate of success in catching species such as tuna, Cakalan, etc, because they don’t have the equipment them. In addition they don’t know the way to process this catch, because the techniques they use for preserving the whale meat will not work for these species. - When hunting manta rays, they are able to use both the Peledang (whaling boats) and motorboats, but when whaling only the Peledang is used. - In the past, Flying fish was caught by using a quill fishing rod, but today most will use a fishing net. - When a Leo rope is used in the motorboat, it cannot also be used in the peledang (whaling boat). According to the Lamalera community, the Leo rope is the soul of peledang and can only be used for harpooning whales, mantas, or other large fish species.
--	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There are two kinds of ray fish being caught: the big white Ray and the big black Ray. - “Mola-Mola” is sold directly at the market or consumed by the Lamalera people after being caught: it is not used for barter because it cannot be preserved. - Flying fish and whales are processed by preserving with salt and drying in the sun. - The price of one brafeng (half tail of whale) is Rp. 50,000 - Besides whaling, they also weave palm leaves and make palm wine in order to get extra income. - Lamalera employs a unique clan economic system; there are standard rules for whale distribution among the clans. <p>Note: In recent years, the number of commercial fishing boats in the Sawu Sea has increased, and as a result the Lamalera villagers have seen their fish catch decline. The villagers are also very concerned about a proposed mining operation on Lembata island because the mining waste has the potential to pollute the coastal waters near the village and result in a further decrease in whale/fish catch and availability.</p> <p><u>The roles of women in social economic life in Lamalera village</u></p> <p>By: Katarina Nudek</p> <p>The women in Lamalera occupy a very important role in economic life of the village. They are usually very involved in the processing of the fishes caught at sea and are also responsible for preparing their families for the off-season when no whales are available. The women of Lamalera also weave, make salt as well as handicrafts to earn extra income for the benefit of their families.</p> <p>The economic activities of the women from Lamalera are as follows:</p>
--	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Weaving: According to tradition, cotton thread is dyed using natural materials and woven to make sarongs and other fabrics. The cotton is typically bartered from the mountain villages on Lembata Island because growing crops is difficult around Lamalera. - Barter: The women of Lamalera typically visit the Wulandoni market every Saturday to barter for household necessities. - Among those families who do not receive a portion of whale meat, the women will make Bolo cake and barter it for whale (2 cakes = 1 span (portion) of whale meat). Corn is also used for barter; a plate of corn can typically be traded for a span (portion) of whale meat. - The corn that is bartered for whale meat is typically divided into two parts. First is the corn that hasn't been chopped; it will be cooked directly or pounded. The other half is chopped; it will be preserved by mixing it with ash and consumed in the off-season when whaling is not possible. - The women in Lamalera also manufacture salt from the sea. A portion of salt can be bartered with six stems of corn. In recent times, this practice has been in decline because of a scarcity of firewood. If a better method were found to manufacture salt without using firewood, this would be of great benefit to Lamalera since the sale of salt is a good alternative livelihood in the off-season. As a part of the Lamalera Bali meeting, the representatives visited a salt-making facility that demonstrated more efficient methods of making salt that they hope can be applied to Lamalera. - Making limestone powder from coral stone is another job of the Lamalera villagers. The powdered stone is mixed
--	---

	<p>with betel nut to form a chew that is used like tobacco and spit. This product is also bartered for other foods and commodities at the market.</p> <p>Note:</p> <p>The Lamalera community prefers to barter rather than use money. They feel strongly about preserving this aspect of their culture because it is widely believed that money makes trade “more difficult and limited”. However, they cannot ignore money completely since it is important for other payments such as school tuition fees or large expenses such as paying a carpenter to build a house for them.</p> <p>2. Presentation of Photovoices program for students done by Mr. Valentinus Solo, the headmaster of SMPK APPIS Lamalera.</p> <p><u>Moderator: Saraswati.</u></p> <p>Results of the Photovoices SMPK APPIS Lamalera School Club program are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ This program initially involved a group of 30 students who became the members of Photography club of SMPK APPIS, but after the strong results from this pilot group the program was expanded to allow more students to participate. The skills gained by the first group of participants (such as the ability to operate a digital camera, a knowledge of photography techniques, and a significant improvement in written language ability in their native Indonesian), the school principal requested Photovoices to hold a second Photography training (done on 19 July 2007) so that more students would be able to participate in the Lamalera School Club. ➤ As a result of the participation in the Lamalera School Club, the teacher and principals noticed that the students gained photography skills which might be important after they graduate.
--	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The Lamalera School Club also helped students to gain a better mastery of the written Indonesian language, as they wrote stories for each of the photos they took. Teachers also observed that students made progress in using oral Indonesian. The school also took great pride in the fact that the SMPK APPIS Middle School was awarded the top score in the study of Indonesian language on the whole of Lembata island, and sixth best score in Nusa Tenggara Timur province. ➤ The photographs taken by the students are not only about their daily lives in the Lamalera village or at school, but also about historical places. They have gained a greater understanding about their village and its culture. As a result of taking photographs of historical or important places, the students often visited the village elders to ask everything about the photograph. The village considers this to be one of the great benefits of the Photovoices program because the older generation can teach the younger generation about their culture and tradition of Lamalera. ➤ Considering these benefits, the Lamalera School Club program was made a permanent part of the school curriculum since July 2007. ➤ As a part of the process of finding subjects for photography, books donated by Photovoices as well as village elders were used as resources. They also used some books in the school library. ➤ The students also created small exhibit on one of the walls at their school to display their photos and stories from the Photovoices School Club. ➤ Photovoices has donated four digital cameras to SMPK APPIS, but the school would like more so that they can expand the program and keep it active in the community. <p>Note:</p> <p>The village wishes to consult a photography expert to further develop the School Club program.</p>
--	---

	<p>Closing statement:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <p>Closing statement from Lamalera community by Mr. Charles:</p> <p>“Lamalera villagers really thank to all organizations which involve in the project (Photovoices, National Geographic, WWF, and Ford Foundation). We truly appreciate for Lamalera can be one of the project areas of Photovoices, the villagers of Lamalera have got many advantages from this program such as to re learn Lamalera culture and tradition that might have been forgotten and to document the culture and tradition in photographs, it can be really essential thing to next generation to know their native culture. We understand if there is positive and negative perspective among others, but right now we can really think about to conserve our culture and to develop our economic in the future.”</p> <p>Closing statement from Ford Foundation (Heidi & Ujjwal)</p> <p>Heidi: “I guess this meeting has really come to success. The villagers are really confident in their presentation, everything is prepared well, and they have responded to every question and suggestion very well. This meeting is organized well and professionally.”</p> <p>Ujjwal: “The presentation by the villagers is really good, the audience can learn a lot about Lamalera village and its culture from the real source, then they can find channels in both government or other organizations in order to help Lamalera to overcome its problems and obstacles. This meeting is just a beginning, I hope there will be another action in reaching our purpose. I really hope that from Photovoices project, the villagers of Lamalera can express their aspiration to the local government and other important persons who have capability in determining development policy for Lamalera village.”</p> <p>Closing statement from Forestry department (Mr. Ari Indrawan)</p>
--	--

	<p>“I am really grateful to the Lamalera villagers who have a great culture and tradition, they can provide important information for all people who join this meeting. The discussion is really interactive; all people are really enthusiastic to ask questions or give suggestions. From the information we have received in this meeting, I hope all related persons can take a significant action. I am, as a representative of the Forestry Department, really interested in the Photovoices program, I think it is really unique and good in empowering people; we will always support this program as long as it can bring good thing to local people. I think this meeting can be done again with other related institutions, and I hope it can be coordinated with the Forestry Department, so we can build a good partnership in good cooperation.”</p> <p>The meeting is closed and Lamalera villagers grant some photographs to the Ford Foundation and Forestry Department. And then they take a group picture.</p> <p>Day 3, 13 March 2008 (only for Lamalera villagers).</p> <p>Field visit to Klungkung regency in order to observe salt making which does not use firewood and to Badung regency in order to observe coconut shell craft process.</p>
<p>NOTES ON ISSUES FOLLOW-UP COMMITMENTS</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The Lamalera people requested that (Photovoices-WWF-NGS) will create a book to document the Photovoices project in Lamalera which can be given to the Lamalera villagers (with design assistance from NGI). 2. (Mr. Leonard Nahak – the head of Kupang museum). All photographs and stories taken and written by Lamalera villagers are very important to be exhibited and published; the Kupang Museum is prepared to exhibit them (possibly in September 2008). 3. (Tantyo Bangun-NGI) invited all Bali meeting attendees to

	<p>attend the Photo Expo held on 14 March 2008 in Jakarta. National Geographic Indonesia will hold a discussion relating to the Lamalera project and also will exhibit Lamalera photographs. (Coordinated by Mrs. Elshinta, Joints Press release of National Geographic Indonesia, Photovoices, WWF, and Ford Foundation has been prepared).</p> <p>4. (Mr. Ari, representative of Forestry Department). The result of Photovoices project in Lamalera is mostly about Fishery and cultural issues. He hopes that those issues can be coordinated with the local Forestry Department and Tourism Department in order to help solve the problems existing in Lamalera today and to develop sustain its economic future.</p> <p>5. (Photovoices). Lamalera villagers hope to continue documenting the important cultural moments in their community that haven't been captured yet. Photovoices has donated four digital cameras and the contact persons of Photovoices in Lamalera will send any additional information to WWF or the Photovoices office in Bali.</p>
--	--